



# MINUTES

Friday, December 7, 2012

## RAQC MEMBERS PRESENT

Andy Spielman, *Chairman, Hogan Lovells*  
Melissa Chalona, *CTL\Thompson Inc*  
Eric Doering, *Citizen*  
Steve Hogan, *City of Aurora*  
Darryl Jones, *Coventry Development*  
Elise Jones, *Colorado Environmental Coalition*  
Doug Linkhart, *Denver Department of Environmental Health*  
Ben Manvel, *City of Fort Collins*  
Jackie Millet, *City of Lone Tree*  
John Putnam, *Kaplan, Kirsch, & Rockwell, LLP*  
Jep Semen, *Corporate Advocates*  
Skip Spensley, *Environmental Consultant*  
David Stewart, *EnCana Oil & Gas (USA)*  
Joyce Thomas, *City of Federal Heights*  
Will Toor, *Boulder County*  
Elena Wilken, *Colorado Association of Transit Agencies*  
Tracy Winfree, *City of Boulder*

## RAQC MEMEBERS NOT PRESENT

Reeves Brown, *Colorado Department of Local Affairs*  
Rick Garcia, *Department of Urban Housing and Development (advisory)*  
Don Hunt, *Colorado Department of Transportation*  
Bob Murphy, *City of Lakewood*  
Paul Natale, *City of Commerce City*  
Jennifer Schaufele, *Denver Regional Council of Governments*  
Chris Urbina, *Colorado Department of Public Health and Environment*  
Phil Washington, *Regional Transportation District*

## RAQC ALTERNATES PRESENT

Martha Rudolph, *Colorado Department of Public Health and Environment*  
Lee Cryer, *Regional Transportation District*

## RAQC STAFF PRESENT

Ken Lloyd, Meg Alderton, Lauren Beliles, Kate Cooke, Jerry Dilley, Steve McCannon, Kate Ruygrok and Anne Ritter.

## OTHERS PRESENT

Pat Campbell, Cummins INC.; David Stewart, EnCana; Karen Hancock, City of Aurora; Andrew Casper, COGA; Joe Castro, City of Boulder; Beth Powell, City of Boulder; Margie Christiansen, RAQC ; Ellen Will, CASTA; Daniel Kenny, Littleton Public Schools; Theresa Takushi, CDPHE-APCD; Mim Mirsky, Engines Off! Denver; Andy Rees, Engines Off! Denver; Natalia Swalnick, American Lung Association; Sabrina Williams, Colorado Department of Transportation; Lauren Quillian, Project FEVER .

---

The meeting was called to order at 10:01 a.m. by Council Member John Putnam. A quorum was present.

### **Approval of Agenda**

**Skip Spensley moved to approve the agenda. Seconded by Debra Perkins-Smith. Motion passed without objection.**

### **Approval of Minutes- September 7, 2012**

Debra Perkins-Smith indicated that Don Hunt should be included in the “MEMBERS NOT ATTENDING” section. **Jackie Millet moved to approve the minutes with the change noted above. Seconded by Elise Jones. Motion passed without objection.**

### **Informational Items**

#### *Chair*

None.

#### *Executive Director*

Ken Lloyd introduced Lee Cryer, Regional Transportation District, who was sitting in for Bill Van Meter. Ken announced that Misty Howell, Board Secretary, was ill and will not be in attendance. Lauren Beliles will be taking minutes in her absence.

#### *Members*

John Putnam introduced Joyce Thomas, City of Federal Heights, to those members not present at the previous board meeting. Mayor Thomas was recently appointed to Council.

Martha Rudolph, Colorado Department of Public Health and Environment, announced the Air Pollution Control Division will be initiating a stakeholder process in January (date tentative) looking at fugitive emission controls for the oil and gas industry.

### **Public Comment**

None.

### **Fostering Electric Vehicle Expansion in the Rockies (Project Fever)**

Ken Lloyd introduced the panel members: Natalia Swalnick, Denver Metro Clean Cities Coalition; Sabrina Williams, Colorado Department of Transportation; Joe Castro, City of Boulder; and Steve McCannon, Regional Air Quality Council.

## **Project FEVER Introduction**

Natalia Swalnick introduced Project FEVER (Fostering Electric Vehicle Expansion in the Rockies), a state-wide effort engaging with stakeholders to understand a variety of issues and solutions related to electric vehicle readiness. This project includes three major phases. Phase one consisted of understanding six key elements of electric vehicle readiness: utilities, permitting, policy recommendations, zoning, education and outreach, and fleet outreach. Phase one is now complete. Phase two is the release of the plan created in phase one. The printed plan will be available on December 18<sup>th</sup>, 2012. Phase three will look at direct future funding available to electric vehicles and EVSE.

## **Emissions Analysis of Projected Electric Vehicle Use in Colorado**

Sabrina Williams presented the emissions analysis of projected electric vehicle use in Colorado. The presentation covered the background of the analysis, the associated colleagues, and the study. The study was described in more detail covering the modeling approach, sensitivity testing, life cycle analysis, assumptions, and results.

## **Final Report and Recommendations of Project FEVER**

Natalia Swalnick then presented the final report and recommendations of Project FEVER. The project had 160 partners and as a result consensus was difficult. Instead, Project FEVER has created a menu of options. The menu of options covered the recommendations in education and outreach, businesses, utilities, permitting, policy, industry education, financing, and moving forward. Project FEVER also has an online portal [www.electricridecolorado.com](http://www.electricridecolorado.com).

John Putnam opened the floor for discussion and questions for Natalia and Sabrina.

Joyce Thomas inquired about public education regarding the safe handling of an electric vehicle battery for individuals. The education of Firefighters, Police, and Emergency Medical Technicians regarding the safe handling of electric vehicle batteries was discussed during the presentation. Mayor Thomas is concerned about the possibility of an individual being shocked to death by an electric vehicle battery. Natalia noted that this type of education would need to be conducted by the dealership from which the vehicle was purchased as purchase information is confidential. Natalia also noted that owners of electric vehicles could and should reference their owner's manual. Natalia will consider including information about the possible shock from an electric vehicle battery on the Project FEVER website.

Will Toor inquired if any analysis had been completed to compare electric and natural gas options. Natalia noted that Project FEVER is focused exclusively on electric vehicles. However, she also mentioned Clean Cities is energy neutral. Sabrina stated that Colorado Department of Transportation will perform a natural gas emissions study sometime in 2013 piloted with Colorado Energy Office and Federal Highway Administration. This study will include life cycle impacts. Sabrina also noted the Environmental Protection Agency has completed a national study showing an eleven percent natural gas emission reduction over combustion engines. Will said it is important that a Colorado specific understanding of emissions benefits of the different technologies is gathered to inform future decisions. John Putnam would like to know more information about diesel vehicles. Natalia mentioned fueleconomy.gov is a currently available resource for comparison.

Will Toor asked if the sensitivity analysis included an aggressive renewable scenario. Sabrina affirmed the study did include an aggressive renewable scenario.

Doug Linkhart inquired why the study used incremental analysis. Sabrina replied incremental analysis was used because it is the most likely use scenario.

David Stewart wanted to know if there is total emission benefit information included in the study. Sabrina noted it is available in percent of emissions reduction as well as tons per day reduction. Natalia mentioned the emissions reduction was recorded in this way because it is the most useful for the RAQC in SIP planning in the future.

John Putnam questioned whether Xcel Energy is talking about off peak incentives for customers with electric vehicles and if so what is the timeline. Natalia noted there is not much of a financial incentive due to the already very low cost of electricity. Lauren Quillian, Project FEVER, stated that Xcel Energy has proposed a rate structure to incentivize off peak use and is considering other options.

Joyce Thomas inquired about the cost to an individual related to having an electric vehicle charging station at home. Natalia stated that for an individual with a 120 volt plug in a garage or carport charging is already possible. EVSE level two stations currently cost between \$1,000 to \$2,500 on average nationally. Permitting costs are available through the Project Fever report. Natalia also noted that often these costs can be rolled into the loan or lease price of the vehicle.

### **Boulder Smart Grid Electric Vehicle Pilot Project**

Joe Castro presented the Boulder Smart Grid Electric Vehicle Pilot Project. The pilot program was a federally funded grant project to increase the use of alternatively fueled vehicles, test smart charging and billing infrastructure, test rate plans and gather learning from other EV pilots. Over three years the program has made the pilot building 40 percent more efficient. Peak loads are of particular importance as they define the demand rate. Joe also discussed next steps for the project.

John Putnam opened the floor for questions for Joe Castro.

Joyce Thomas expressed concern for localities as costs are currently high. Mayor Thomas inquired what the cost is to have employees study peak electrical costs. Joe stated that RMI is currently studying peak costs, which is funded through grant monies.

Debra Perkins-Smith inquired about the number of electric vehicles currently in the Boulder Smart Grid Electric Vehicle Pilot Program. Joe stated there are currently three Nissan Leaf vehicles and one Chevy Volt to be purchased soon.

Will Toor wanted to further understand the interaction between time of day and demand charges as his assumption was the vehicles could simply be charged at night when peak demand was lower. Will also asked if the day time peaks are a result of public charging. Joe noted there are some peaks at night. Joe also noted there is a need to better understand the 24 hour cycle of peak demand. Currently, there is a one dollar an hour charge to use the vehicle charging station; Joe would like to continue to be able to allow the public to charge during the day.

## **RAQC Program for Electric Vehicle/Infrastructure Development in the Denver Region**

Steve McCannon presented the Regional Air Quality Council's program for Electric Vehicle and Infrastructure Development in the Denver Region. The RAQC has received funding for an Electric Vehicle and Electric Vehicle Supply Equipment project for the Denver metro area. The RAQC will solicit local government and private entity participation. The RAQC is working with Colorado Energy Office (CEO) who also received funding; however, CEO funding is only for EVSE and only for projects outside the Denver metro area. The RAQC and stakeholders have developed an application that will be required for all projects. The application covers goals, eligibility, mandatory requirements, planning criteria, project scope, funding requests, charging unit specifications, documentation and funding availability. The goals of the program include incentivizing the change to EV, reducing harmful air pollutants, promoting energy security, encouraging technological innovation, advancing fleet sustainability, reducing climate changing emissions, and promoting greening government initiatives.

John Putnam opened the floor for questions for Steve.

Steve Hogan said the application process appears to be a significant amount of work for applicants and the RAQC and questioned the necessity of the process. Steve McCannon responded that this level of planning on the part of the applicant is necessary to help ensure successful implementation. Steve also noted as applications and projects are executed models can be created easing the burden on future applicants. Mayor Hogan wanted to be sure smaller jurisdictions have access to these funds. Steve assured Mayor Hogan he will be cognizant of this issue and will work with applicants.

Doug Linkhart inquired if car dealers are a part of this process. Steve commented that while some car dealers are involved nothing is final yet. Steve mentioned the possibility of electric vehicle "ride and drives" in the future.

### *Public Comment*

Daniel Kenny, Littleton Public Schools, expressed concern for school bus cabin air quality due to a recent study showing continued poor cabin air quality after retrofit. Sabrina replied CDPHE has studied pre- and post-retrofit school bus cabin air quality and post-retrofit the air quality did show improvement. Steve noted this is likely due to ambient air.

Karen Hancock, City of Aurora, inquired if there is a plan to incentivize electric vehicle charging to encourage locations that are most logical geographically. Natalia noted CEO, pending final contract, will be hiring a staff member for energy coaching in transportation. This individual will be available to all municipalities and will help implement the initiatives of Project FEVER. Karen noted the City of Aurora would like to participate. Natalia commented Clean Cities is always willing to help and be a resource for all municipalities large and small.

Steve Hogan noted the information about this grant must be distributed to all municipalities regardless of size.

Will Toor asked which policy initiatives are most pressing at the state level. Natalia noted there is an individual working with legislators to inform and work with Home Owners' Associations regarding electric vehicle charging. Sabrina noted that tax credits need to be kept in place. Lauren Quillian noted that policy recommendations are in the Project FEVER final report and the recommendations are largely related to financing.

## **Selection of Consultant for Creative Marketing/Advertising Support for OzoneAware Campaign**

Meg Alderton recommended the incumbent, Launch Advertising, as the Creative Marketing and Advertising support for the 2013 and 2014 OzoneAware campaign. Launch was recommended due to extensive knowledge of the issue, fresh ideas for revitalization of the campaign, an exclusive with Channel 7 including Mike Nelson as a spokesperson, and targeted messaging. The contract budget is \$170,000 over two years and will begin in January of 2013.

Doug Linkhart inquired whether there have been any results from this campaign. Meg replied results from a focus group in August of 2012, showed while there have been results from the campaign the strides have plateaued. Meg also indicated that the need to refresh the campaign was included as part of the RFP and that Launch provided the best ideas for moving forward.

**Jep Seman moved to adopt the recommendation as presented. Seconded by Darryl Jones. Motion passed without objection.**

## **Proposed 2013 RAQC Work Program and Budget**

Ken Lloyd gave an overview of the Work Program which included a continuation of the work from 2012. Ken noted the work will remain focused on projects related to ozone. These projects include ozone modeling, scenario work, the OzoneAware campaign, electric vehicles, alternative fuels, and diesel retrofits. Ken also gave an overview of the budget. Ken commented the RAQC is well funded through 2013 with funding from local governments, the Colorado Department of Health and Environment, and some private companies. RAQC programs are largely funded through grants including grants from CMAQ and EPA. Staff levels are to remain the same with nine staff members. Ken noted that cost of living salary increases were not included in the budget as this decision was up to the Board. Last year cost of living increases were granted at three percent. Ken noted for each one percent of increase there is a \$6,500 change in the budget.

John Putnam thanked the local governments for their support of the RAQC.

Will Toor asked whether there were any indications of a new ozone standard, given President Obama's re-election. Ken noted the EPA is scheduled to propose new standards by the end of 2013, however the implementation of a new standard is not eminent. Also, Ken commented the RAQC still has the 75ppb ozone standard to work on through 2015 and a possible new standard will not fully take effect until the end of the decade. Will Toor said he thinks the standard will affect work of the RAQC.

Will Toor said he would like to know more about oil and gas in conjunction with fugitive emissions. Martha Rudolph stated CDPHE will start a stakeholder process looking at adopting the remainder of NSPS regulations from EPA and to consider controls related to fugitive emissions in January of 2013. Ken noted the RAQC will be engaged with this stakeholder process. John Putnam suggested this would be a good future board meeting topic.

Elena Wilken asked if the RAQC's lawn and garden equipment program will be funded in 2013. Ken stated the Mow Down Pollution event is not yet funded but the RAQC continues to look for funding. Ken also noted because the event has a strong foundation it will be easy to move

forward once funding is secured. Joyce Thomas had some questions about the functionality of electric lawn mowers.

Ben Manvel had a question about how global positioning systems help to reduce idle emissions located on page 6 of the work program. Kate Ruygrok explained fleets use GPS to track what vehicles do in the field and then use this information to incentivize or force drivers to idle less. Kate also noted GPS systems are useful tools for optimizing routes and reducing vehicle miles travelled.

Doug Linkhart noted that funds from the private sector are \$15,000 and questioned if there was potential to increase private sector funding. Ken stated the RAQC has explored that option and noted that while the private sector is interested in specific programs, such as Suncor and the Mow Down Pollution event, it is very difficult to secure funding for operational costs. Doug then asked where the \$15,000 came from. Ken stated the private sector funds come from Xcel Energy who has been a funder for twenty years. Doug thought it could be useful to collaborate with the Colorado Municipal League or with counties and other organizations as a way to secure more funds. Doug also said perhaps associate members could pay a fee. Melissa Chalona noted the Climate Wise Programs as a potential example of using promotion as a way to show incentives to be a partner. Ken also noted if there are any companies our Board Members know of that want to be associate members, the RAQC can make provisions.

Doug Linkhart recommended a full cost-of-living salary increase and recommended fully funding a cost-of-living salary increase every year. Ben Manvel questioned what the percent increase would be. Ken proposed three percent. Jackie Millet stated three percent was high comparatively to the City of Lone Tree. Doug commented the City and County of Denver received increases at 2.4% this year. Jackie recommended tying the RAQC salary increases to some other organization. She thought the Mountain State Employers would be a good example to follow. Will Toor concurred. He thinks this year that would be around 2.3% or 2.4% to be in line with other government organizations. Will noted this percent of increase would be defensible. Jackie noted there are government and non-government rates of increase.

**Will Toor moved to set cost of living salary increase to Mountain State Employers council based on average governmental agencies increase and to approve the 2013 budget. Seconded by Steve Hogan. Motion passed without objection.**

Skip Spensley requested this style of salary increase is included in the budget next year.

*Public Comment*

None.

### **Proposed 2013 Meeting Calendar and Suggestions for Next Meeting**

Council reviewed future meeting dates. Misty Howell will follow up with the Board on future meeting dates. Elena Wilken suggested the legislative session as a topic for the February meeting. John Putnam would like to hear more about oil and gas in a future meeting. Martha Rudolph may present some information about the fugitive emissions stakeholder process at the February meeting, but will not yet have any reports to present. Elise Jones would like to have a broad understanding of fugitive emissions at the federal and state level. Skip Spensley would like to hear about the Western Ozone Compact in a future meeting and would like to invite EPA

to present. Ken noted he had not yet heard from EPA on this. Elena would like to hear about the West Light Rail Line efforts and about Every Trip Counts after April. Will Toor would like to know about the DRCOG 2040 process in April. John Putnam would like to receive updates on Every Trip Counts and OzoneAware as well as collaborations with RTD and DRCOG.

### **Adjournment**

There being no further business before the Council, the meeting was adjourned at 12:03pm.